

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov

First District, San Francisco

BILL LEONARD Second District, Ontario/Sacramento

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

> JUDY CHU, Ph.D. Fourth District, Los Angeles

> > State Controller

JOHN CHIANG

August 5-7, 2008 PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTION

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING

5901 Green Valley Circle, Room 207, Culver City

RAMON J. HIRSIG **Executive Director**

Tuesday, August 5, 2008

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the August 5-7, 2008 Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Rose Smith at (916) 323-9656 or e-mail: Rose.Smith@boe.ca.gov Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

Α. Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Hearings There are no items for this matter.

B. **Corporate Franchise and Personal Income Tax Hearings**

B1. Thomas Y. Chung and Chan N. Chung, 395925

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Appeal Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

- B2. Ana M. Moore and Mitchell Moore, 281619—Deferred
- B3. Elizabeth Dunham, 334589—Dismissed

B4. Electronic Data Systems Corporation (EDS), 361467

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Appeal Granted	Dr. Chu	No
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

- B5. Helmut D. Mees and Rebecca Mees, 405246—Postponed
- B6. Oscar E. Martinez, 402210—Postponed
- B7. Mark Emad Towfiq and Carol K. Nakahara, 396384—Dismissed
- B8. Francelle Vercher, 417995

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Appeal Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
A \$750.00 frivolous appeal penalty	Mr. Leonard	Yes
was ordered.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

B9. Victor Roy, 395839

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Appeal Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
A \$5,000.00 frivolous appeal	Mr. Leonard	Yes
penalty was ordered.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C1. Aromatic Research & Tech, LLC, 301405 (OH)

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C2. Ibrahim Ibrahim and Sahar Ibrahim, 310288 (EH)

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination.	Dr. Chu	Yes
The Board ordered that the petition be submitted for decision, granting the petitioner 30 days to file supporting documents, the Department 30 days to respond, and the Appeals Division 30 days thereafter to review the petitioner's supporting documents, the Department's response and	Mr. Leonard Ms. Steel Ms. Yee Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes Yes Yes Yes
provide its recommendation to the Board.		

C3. Ralph A. Sandoval and Rafael G. Sandoval, 406895 (EA)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

D. Special Taxes Appeals Hearing

This item is scheduled for Wednesday, August 6, 2008.

There are no items for these matters:

- E. Property Tax Appeals Hearings
- F. Public Hearings

G. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters – Consent

G1 Legal Appeals Matters

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes
No Final Determination on	Mr. Leonard	Yes
sub-items 4, 5, 6a-c, 7, 8	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

- Hearing Notice Sent Appearance waived
 - 1. Western Dairy Construction, Inc., 358121 (KH)
- Hearing Notice Sent No Response
 - 2. Daniel Sekyun Roh, 342557 (AC)
 - 3. Dastigir G. Omar, 355261 (EH)
 - Quick Pick Food Stores Liquor, Inc., 254339 (EA)
 - 5. Tobacco Retailing USA, Inc., 139097 (AA)
 - 6a. Tal Rubin, 360275 (AC)
 - 6b. Sunrise Collections, Inc., 282023 (AC)
 - 6c. Yael Rubin, 360274 (AC)
 - 7. K.S. Designs, Inc., 312861 (AA)
 - 8. Donald R. Loya, 358842 (AC)
 - 9. Jose Agustin Fernandez, 400766 (AR)
 - 10. Vahagn Catering, Inc., 334789 (AP)
- Petitions for Release of Seized Property
 - 11. Saad Yelda Attisha, 443074 (ET)
 - 12. Elia Lewis Rezkalla and Rezk S. Rezk, 443058 (ET)

G2 Franchise and Income Tax Matters

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

- Decisions
 - 1. Alison Buergel, 333132
 - 2. Urve Pormeister, 382831
 - 3. A. G. Warner, 359094
 - 4. Collin M. Wing, 352189
- Petitions for Rehearing
 - 5. Sajid Batliwala and Rafia Batliwala, 329805
 - Carol Grant, 383405
 - 7. Charles A. Harris, 381473
 - 8. Gilbert L. Tauberg and Mina Tauberg, 360375
 - 9. Judy Walther, 383468
- Hearing Notice Sent Appearance Waived
 - 10. Jon Maple, 398911
 - 11. Shawn Mills, 395824
 - 12. Roger Romero, 397740
 - 13. Ruth Vinson, 384140
 - 14. Ruth Vinson, 384249

G3 Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Matters

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes
No Final Determination on	Mr. Leonard	Yes
sub-item 4	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

Decisions

- 1. Nasib Duggal, 403206
- 2. Terrie Hatcher, 394502
- 3. Andrew Moore, 423198
- 4. Allan Walden, 383500

G4 Sales and Use Taxes Matters

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes- except not participating in sub item 3

Redeterminations

- 1. Dearborn Financial Institute, Inc., 379941 (OH)
- 2. Mountain States Steel, Inc., 390199 (OH)
- Relief of Penalty/Interest
 - 3. Beckman Coulter, Inc., 443861 (EA)
- Denials of Claims for Refund
 - 4. Hyundai Motor Finance Company, 396356 (EA)
 - 5. John Arthur Hays, 310921 (AR)

G5 Sales and Use Taxes Matters – Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes- except not participating in sub item 12
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

Credits and Cancellations

- 1. William S. Kurr, 445807 (OH)
- 2. Michael C. Fina Corporate Sales, Inc., 433828 (OH)
- 3. Monica R. Ruiz, 445525 (EH)

Refunds

- 4. Bowne of Los Angeles, Inc., 133520 (AS)
- 5. Telogy, Inc., 422014 (CH)
- 6. Ariat International, Inc., 444199 (CH)
- 7. Sims Group USA Corporation, 433716 (CH)
- 8. Westamerica Graphics Corp., 400031 (EA)
- 9. Cubic Defense Systems, Inc., 375114 (FH)
- 10. Hyundai Motor Finance Company, 396356 (EA)
- 11. Mercedes-Benz USA, LLC, 436855 (KH)
- 12. Time Warner Entertainment Co., L.P., 391663 (OH)
- 13. Gateway Companies, Inc., 334971 (OH)
- 14. Motor Coach Industries, Inc., 440263 (OH)
- 15. Sutter Visiting Nurse Association and Hospice, 420057 (KH)
- 16. Gateway Professional, LLC, 334976 (OH)
- 17. BMW of North America, LLC, 444613 (OH)
- 18. Star CNC Machine Tool Corp., 417774 (AP)
- 19. Star Financial Services, 433715 (AP)
- 20. Mission Financial Services Corporation, 430891 (EA)
- 21. Rackable Systems, Inc., 420667 (CH)
- 22. Pure Process Systems, Inc., 444729 (OH)
- 23. 1st United Services Credit Union, 424979 (CH)
- 24. Sprint Communications Company, LP, 404176 (OH)
- 25. First Financial Credit Union, 433712 (AP)
- 26. Northrop Grumman Federal Credit Union, 432541 (AS)

G6 Special Taxes Matters

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes– except not participating in sub item 1

Relief of Penalty

- 1. Tesoro Refining and Marketing Company, 445176 (MT) 'CF'
- Tesoro Refining and Marketing Company, 445177 (MT)
- 3. Omnipoint Communications, Inc., 448066 (ET)
- Denial of Claim for Refund
 - 4. Asher Shaitrit, 438143 (ET)

G7 Special Taxes Matters - Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved Staff Recommendations	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes– except not participating in sub item 1
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes- except not participating in sub item 2

> Refunds

- 1. Conocophillips Company, 388730 (MT)
- Ohio National Life Assurance Corp., 442016 (ET) 'CF'

There are no items for these matters:

- G8 Property Tax Matters
- G9 Cigarette License Fee Matters
- G10 Legal Appeals Property Tax Matters

H. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters – Adjudicatory

There are no items for these matters:

- H1 Legal Appeals Matters
- H2 Franchise and Income Tax Matters
- H3 Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Matters
- H4 Sales and Use Taxes Matters

H5 Sales and Use Taxes Matters – Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds These items are scheduled for Wednesday, August 6, 2008.

There are no items for these matters:

- H6 Special Taxes Matters
- H7 Special Taxes Matters Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds
- H8 Property Tax Matters
- H9 Cigarette License Fee Matters
- H10 Legal Appeals Property Tax Matters

There are no items for these matters:

Tax Program Nonappearance Matters

Chief Counsel Matters

There are no items for these matters:

- J. Rulemaking
- K. Business Taxes
- L. Property Taxes
- M. Other Chief Counsel Matters

Administrative Session

There are no items for these matters:

- N. Consent Agenda
- O. Adoption of Board Committee Reports and Approval of Committee Actions
- P. Other Administrative Matters

Q. Closed Session

This item is scheduled for Wednesday, August 6, 2008.

Page 8 of 15



STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov BETTY T. YEE First District, San Francisco

BILL LEONARD Second District, Ontario/Sacramento

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JUDY CHU, Ph.D.

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

Fourth District, Los Angeles

RAMON J. HIRSIG Executive Director

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 5901 Green Valley Circle, Room 207, Culver City August 5-7, 2008

PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTION

Wednesday, August 6, 2008

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the August 5-7, 2008 Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Rose Smith at (916) 323-9656 or e-mail: Rose.Smith@boe.ca.gov Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C4. Bobby Eugene Cook, 333472 (FH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
The Board directed staff to offer	Mr. Leonard	Yes
petitioner a payment plan.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C5.a. Jasvir Badesha, 315512 (EH)

C5.b. Jasvir Badesha and Amarjit Badesha, 315514 (EH)

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petitions Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C6. Robere's Jewelry, Inc., 220461 (FH)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C7. American Telephone and Telegraph Company, 251880, 330162 (OH)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Not participating

C8. Edwardo Orta, 390729 (AP)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
•	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

H. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters – Adjudicatory

H5 Sales and Use Taxes Matters – Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

> Refund

1. Sea World, Inc., 415835 (FH)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Claim Granted	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Not participating
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C9. Carrolandia #1 Auto Sales, Inc., 360245 (AS)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C10. Jose Efrain Medinilla, 252958 (AP)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C11. Jake Earl Williams, 288780 (EH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C12. Trung Duc Trinh and Shelly C. Yun-Trinh, 330253 (AS)

C13. Shaya Beverly Center, Inc., 330254 (AS)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination.	Dr. Chu	Yes
The Board ordered that the petition be submitted for decision, granting the petitioner 30 days to file supporting documents, the Department 30 days to respond, and the Appeals Division 30 days thereafter to review the petitioner's supporting documents, the Department's response and provide its recommendation to the Board.	Mr. Leonard Ms. Steel Ms. Yee Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes Yes Yes Yes

- D. Special Taxes Appeals Hearing
 - D1. Adnan Hasan Bawanah, 314857 (ET)—Postponed
- Q. Closed Session





STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov

First District, San Francisco

BILL LEONARD Second District, Ontario/Sacramento

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JUDY CHU, Ph.D.

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

Fourth District, Los Angeles

RAMON J. HIRSIG **Executive Director**

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 5901 Green Valley Circle, Room 207, Culver City August 5-7, 2008

PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTION

Thursday, August 7, 2008

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the August 5-7, 2008 Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Rose Smith at (916) 323-9656 or e-mail: Rose.Smith@boe.ca.gov Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C14. Daniel Ilko, 262991, 334436 (FH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

Mostafa Vakilian, 254076 (EA)—Appearance Waived

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
Approved Staff Recommendation	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C16.a. James William Justice, 330247 (EA) C16.b. Joyce Allen Justice, 327635 (EA)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petitions Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

- C17.a. Steven C. Kissen, Diana M. Jianas, and John C. Calderone, 101472 (EA)
- C17.b. Steven C. Kissen, Thomas E. Stone, and Alex T. Jianas, 101476 (AC)
- C17.c. Mr. Bones-Fine Cigars and Tobaccos, Inc., 101475 (EA)
- C17.d. Mr. Bones-Fine Cigars and Tobaccos, Inc., 249937 (FH)
- C17.e. Steven C. Kissen and Diana M. Jianas, 101474 (EA)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petitions Partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
Granted/Denied	Mr. Leonard	Yes
Board ordered that the portion of	Ms. Steel	Yes
the amnesty-interest penalty which is based on interest that had	Ms. Yee	Yes
accrued during the period of delay	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes
in scheduling the hearing in each		
petition be relieved, conditioned on		>
payment of the amnesty-eligible tax and interest, otherwise		
approved staff's revised		
recommendation.		

C18.a. Manouch Lankarani, 252973 (EH)

C18.b. Mountain Magic Motors, Inc., 252972, 359519 (EH)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petitions Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C19. Vishwa Rup Lakhanpal, 100564, 234649 (AR)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Denied	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C20. Danny Kangsok Kim, 386898 (EA)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination.	Dr. Chu	Yes
The Board ordered that the petition	Mr. Leonard	Yes
be submitted for decision, granting	Ms. Steel	Yes
the petitioner 30 days to file	Ms. Yee	Yes
supporting documents, the Department 30 days to respond, and the Appeals Division 30 days thereafter to review the petitioner's supporting documents, the Department's response and provide its recommendation to the Board.	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes

C21. Fred E. Peters, 391649 (EA)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's Petition Granted	Dr. Chu	No
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/Ms. Mandel	Yes